

WHY WE DON'T SAY HALLEL ON PURIM

PURIM

SAYING HALLEL ON PURIM / DIFFERENT LEVELS OF MIRACLES
ERETZ YISRAEL VS. CHUTZ LA'ARETZ / GAVRA AND CHEFTZA

לע"נ זאב ארי' ע"ה בן יבלחט"א שניאור זלמן גליק

In Maseches Megillah¹ it says that it is a great chiddush that it's a mitzvah to read the Megillah, since there were no mitzvos miderabanan added in the times of the Neviim besides for the mitzvah of mikrah Megillah. The Gemara explains the reasoning of the Chachamim for instituting this mitzvah, that if from slavery to freedom (i.e. Pesach), we say shirah, how much more so from death to life (i.e. Purim)!

The Gemara then raises the question, if so, shouldn't we also say Hallel? The Gemara gives three answers:

Since the nesh happened in Chutz La'aretz, we don't say Hallel.

It says in Hallel, “הללו עבדי ה'” (Servants of Hashem, praise). Rava explains, that after Yetzias Mitzraim the Jews were in a state of “Avdei Hashem,” and they could therefore say Hallel. The Jews after the story of Purim were still in Galus, and therefore, as “Avdei Achashverosh,” they could not say Hallel.

R' Nachman says there is a chiyuv to say Hallel, however it is fulfilled by the reading of the Megillah.

The practical difference, brought by the Meiri, between the first two opinions, who hold there is no chiyuv, and R' Nachman's answer, that there is a chiyuv, concerns someone who does not have a Megillah. Only according to R' Nachman will he have to say Hallel.

There are two things we need to understand about Rava's answer:

1. The question of the Gemara still stands. The fact that

1. Daf 14a.

one isn't in a state to say Hallel doesn't detract from the svara that "from death to life, how much more so?"

2. It seems like according to Rava we would say Hallel if the nesh happened in Eretz Yisrael. However, seemingly, if we were no longer "Avdei Achashverosh," we would be in Eretz Yisrael by default. In other words, isn't being in Chutz La'aretz, and being in Galus the same thing?

2 To understand this we would we need to explain the parameters of saying Hallel. The Gemara says in Maseches Shabbos² that one who says Hallel every day is very disrespectful to Hashem. Seemingly it would be a good thing to say Hallel every day, to thank Hashem for all the miracles that He does, as we say in davening, "ועל ניסיון שבכל יום עמנו", (for the miracles You do every day)?

The explanation is, as it says in the Midrash Talpiyos³ that Hallel is only said for open miracles, such as Yetzias Mitzraim. It is therefore disrespectful to Hallel to say it on regular occurrences. An open miracle is a miracle higher than nature, an event that one can clearly see is extraordinary.

This is also implied by the Maharsha, who writes⁴ that Hallel was instituted on certain days for the miracles that happened, in order to show that Hashem can change the natural order of the world.

Based on this, it is unclear whether we should say Hallel on Purim or not. On the one hand, in the story of Purim there were no events that were openly supernatural, so we would



2. *Daf 118b.*

3. *Os 5, on Hallel Hagadol.*

4. *On Maseches Shabbos, ibid.*

not say Hallel. (As indeed the Abudarham asks⁵ why we even make the brachah “She’asa Nissim” on Purim, since there were no open miracles.) On the other hand, the entire story of Purim happened in an entirely irregular way, contrary to how things normally run, so we should say Hallel!

3 In practice the halachah is that we don’t say Hallel on Purim.

We could say that according to Rabbi Nachman the reason we can fulfill the chiyuv of Hallel through Megillah is because it is part of Torah Or, which lights up concealed things, and therefore we can see how there truly were miracles in the Purim story, and we therefore would have to say Hallel. However if one does not have a Megillah, he should still not say Hallel, unlike the Meiri we brought earlier.

Hallel is not said because the miracle wasn’t a revealed one. The two answers in the Gemara are two ways of understanding this. The first answer, that we don’t say Hallel on a nesh that happens in Chutz La’aretz, means that since Eretz Yisrael is the land on which Hashem’s eyes gaze at the entire year,⁶ we can, in Eretz Yisrael, openly see Hashem’s involvement. However outside Eretz Yisrael, Hashem’s involvement is more hidden, and therefore we can’t say Hallel on the miracles that happen there, because we don’t see them openly.

However Rava holds that really we could say Hallel on nisim that occur outside Eretz Yisrael, since they happen in an open manner. However, since we are in Galus, we cannot

5. *Hilchos Birchos Hareiya.*

6. *Devarim 11, 12.*

appreciate them properly and can therefore not say Hallel.

4 The lesson for us is, that we know that the Rebbe Rashab said, that “Only our bodies were sent into Galus” but a Jew’s neshamah is always free. Therefore, even if the Jew’s body is unable to perceive things that are higher than nature, his neshamah can, and it can reveal them!

STUDY AID

1. 3 reasons in the Gemara for why we don't say Hallel on Purim and questions on Rava's answer.
2. The parameters of Hallel, and the doubts regarding Purim.
3. The two ways of explaining why we don't say Hallel on Purim.
4. The lesson, that the neshama helps us feel things that are higher than nature.

Source:

על פי ליקוטי שיחות חלק ל"ו פורים שיחה ב'